



City of Salem

Designer Selection Committee

Meeting Minutes - DRAFT

Thursday, July 18, 2019

A meeting of the Salem Designer Selection Committee was held on Thursday, July 18, 2019 at 98 Washington Street, Salem, MA. **Present:** Jenna Ide, Michael Lutrzykowski (Delegated by Tom St. Pierre), Kathleen Winn (Delegated by Tom Daniel), and Dave Knowlton.

The meeting began at 8:38AM. Members reviewed the remaining applicants' submissions and references, and ranked them based on their ability to meet the evaluation criteria. Overall, the references were good for the designers and their sub-consultants. However, CSS received one negative response regarding their job performance from a local municipality and consequently received a lower ranking. Regarding team qualifications, members agreed that Weston & Sampson should be ranked higher because their team included a real estate appraiser whose services will be key when making the final decision regarding the DPW facility.

Following this discussion, the Committee agreed to conduct a consensus ranking for each applicant based on the Evaluation and Selection Criteria:

Tighe & Bond

- Understanding of the City's needs **Advantageous**
- Project Description and Reference **Advantageous**
- Qualifications of Assigned Staff and Team **Not Advantageous**
- Quality of References **Highly Advantageous**
- Quality of RFQ **Not Advantageous**

Weston & Sampson Engineers

- Understanding of the City's needs **Highly Advantageous**
- Project Description and Reference **Highly Advantageous**
- Qualifications of Assigned Staff and Team **Highly Advantageous**
- Quality of References **Highly Advantageous**
- Quality of RFQ **Highly Advantageous**

CSS Architects

- Understanding of the City's needs **Not Advantageous**
- Project Description and Reference **Highly Advantageous**
- Qualifications of Assigned Staff and Team **Highly Advantageous**
- Quality of References **Highly Advantageous**
- Quality of RFQ **Highly Advantageous**

Based on the evaluation, the Committee voted unanimously to recommend the selection of the highest ranked firm of **Weston & Sampson Engineers**. A summary of the ratings and final rankings is attached.

The Committee reviewed and voted to approve the minutes of the Designer Selection Committee from the meetings of Thursday, April 30, 2019; Tuesday, May 7, 2019 and Thursday July 11, 2019. The meeting adjourned at 9:02 am.

City of Salem RFQ #				19-35-230																								
DPW Facility																												
				(Full criteria description in memo)																								
	Min. Criteria Met	Interview ed	Final Rank	Criteria 1: Understanding of the City's needs				Criteria 2: Project Description and List of Reference Projects				Criteria 3: Qualifications of Assigned Staff and Team				Criteria 4: Quality of References				Criteria 5: Quality of RFQ				Total out of 15				Average Total out of 15
			Raters	ML	JI	KW	Average	ML	JI	KW	Average	ML	JI	KW	Average	ML	JI	KW	Average	ML	JI	KW	Average	ML	JI	KW	Average	
Firm																												
Tighe & Bond	Yes	No	3	2	2	2	2	2.5	2.5	1	2	1.5	1.5	1	1.33	3	2.5	1	2.17	0	2.5	2	1.5	9	11	7	9	
Weston & Sampson	Yes	No	1	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	2.5	3	2.83	3	2.5	3	2.83	3	3	3	3	15	14	15	14.667	
CSS	Yes	No	2	1	2	2	1.67	3	3	3	3	2.5	2.5	2.5	2.5	3	1.5	2.5	2.33	3	3	2	2.67	12.5	12	12	12.167	
Flow Design	NO	No																										
Average				2	2.33	2.33	2.22	2.83	2.83	2.33	2.67	2.33	2.17	2.17	2.22	3	2.17	2.17	2.44	2	2.83	2.33	2.39	12.16	12.33	11.33	11.94467	
Rating: Greater than or Equal to 1 --- Non Avantageous																												
Rating: Greater than 1 but less than 2 ---- Advantageous																												
Rating: Greater than 2 and less than or equal to 3 -- Highly Advantageous																												
Rating: Less than 1 - Unacceptable																												