

SALEM HISTORICAL COMMISSION
MINUTES
July 6, 2016

A meeting of the Salem Historical Commission was held on Wednesday, July 6, 2016 at 7:00 pm at 120 Washington Street, Salem, MA. Present were Jessica Herbert (Chair), Laurie Bellin, Reed Cutting, David Hart, Susan Keenan, Joanne McCrea, and Larry Spang.

1-2 Griffin Place

The Applicant, Dan Botwinick requested a continuance to July 20, 2016.

VOTE: *Mr. Cutting made a motion to approve the continuation. Ms. Bellin seconded the motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried.*

13 Cambridge Street

The Applicants, Michael Sherriff and Eric Richards requested a continuation to July 20, 2016.

VOTE: *Mr. Cutting made a motion to approve the continuation. Ms. Bellin seconded the motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried.*

92 Federal Street

The Applicants, Steven Sass and Ellen Golub, submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace wood shingles on façade dormer with new wood clapboards and paint to match existing paint colors.

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: June 6, 2016
- Photographs

The applicant Steven Sass was present.

Mr. Spang asked the applicant about his previous plans to renovate the building.

Mr. Sass replied that the previous plans were too ambitious and he felt that the work was not appropriate for the building.

Ms. Bellin asked for clarification on whether all of the dormer would be clapboard.

Mr. Sass stated in affirmative.

Ms. Herbert asked about the gutters.

Mr. Sass replied that the Commission had already approved the work.

Mr. Spang asked how the corner boards would be treated.

Mr. Sass stated that the corner boards will be repaired if necessary.

VOTE: *Mr. Hart made a motion to approve the application with clapboard on all sides of the dormer. Ms. Bellin seconded the motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried.*

94 Federal Street

The Applicant, James Gaull, submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to install a new stockade wood fence.

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: June 13, 2016
- Photographs

The applicant James Gaull was not present.

Ms. Herbert asked if the front section of fence would be replaced.

Ms. Kelleher stated that the front section was not specified in the application.

The Commission noted that a small fence section at the side of the driveway was also not specified for replacement and asked whether it was to be included in the Commission's review.

Ms. Herbert and Ms. Bellin discussed whether the plans corresponded with actual dimensions.

Mr. Cutting recommended that it be continued since there are so many questions about plans.

VOTE: *Mr. Spang made a motion to continue the application. Mr. Hart seconded the motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried.*

170 Federal Street

The Applicants, Timothy Obert and Matthew Obey, submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for new paint colors, shutter repairs and install new glass fanlight over entry door.

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: June 20, 2016
- Photographs

Timothy Obert and Matthew Obey were present and presented proposed paint colors and photographs. The doors will be painted black as they are deteriorated and cannot be restored with stain. The wood panel above the entrance doors will be replaced with glass transom.

Ms. Herbert asked for specifications on which sections of the panel would be glazed.

Mr. Obert stated that the area between the moulding would be glazed.

Mr. Obert showed examples of a Cambridge house with the same paint color scheme. He noted that he is also requesting to remove storms to expose arched windows and will be installing new storm windows in black on the other 3 elevations.

Ms. Herbert noted that Commission does not review storm windows.

Mr. Cutting asked if the doors will be painted gloss black.

Mr. Obert replied in the affirmative, noting that they would be the same as the shutters and rear garage doors.

Ms. Herbert asked for public comment.

Joyce Wallace of 172 Federal Street spoke in favor of the application, noting that the owners have put a lot of effort into the proposed work on the building.

VOTE: *Mr. Cutting made a motion to approve the application. Ms. McCrea seconded the motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried.*

7 Botts Court

The Applicants, Alexander Marks and Kimberly Tompkins, submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to alter front entry stairs and install air conditioning condenser unit.

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: June 20, 2016
- Photographs

The applicant Alexander Marks was present.

Ms. Herbert read a letter of support from Lawrence Frej, 343 Essex Street/9 Botts Court into the record.

Ms. Herbert asked about the design of the new set of stairs on the opposite side of the entry deck and whether would be straight or have a turn.

Mr. Marks stated that they would be straight since a curved staircase would take up space in the yard.

Ms. Herbert stated that the stair could have several steps, then a platform, and then a turn.

Ms. Herbert asked whether the applicant would request an expansion of the deck if the existing stairs are removed.

Mr. Marks replied that he envisioned only a nominal expansion of several floor boards, which would be necessary to install a railing.

Ms. Kelleher noted that an expansion of the deck may violate zoning and recommended that the applicant speak with the Planning Department or Building Inspector.

Ms. Herbert noted that the applicant decided to remove the existing stairs, he would need to come back to the Commission for approval.

Ms. Bellin asked if the design of the new stair would be similar to the existing stair.

Mr. Marks replied in the affirmative, noting that the design will replicate the original design as closely as possible.

Ms. Bellin asked whether building codes would require changes to the railing design.

Ms. Herbert explained Salem's codes regarding railings and said that the building permit may require specific design.

Ms. Bellin asked if the new stairs would impact the use of the existing gate.

Mr. Marks replied in the negative, but noted that if the existing stairs were removed in the future, he may decide to change the gate.

Ms. Herbert asked for public comment.

Lou Siriani, 6 Botts Court, spoke in favor of the application, noting that the house had been moved to Botts Court and placed on a raised foundation and that the present stairs are not original. He also noted that other houses on Botts Court have gardens at their entrances and the removal of the stair at this property would allow the owners to plant a front garden at their property.

Mr. Spang asked whether the new stair would have a concrete base.

Mr. Marks replied that he would prefer to have all wood stair.

VOTE: *Ms. Bellin made a motion to approve stairs to match existing except for bottom most stair which will be wood. Length of rail to be determined by building inspector and stair to be painted. Reed seconded the motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried. Mr. Hart abstained.*

The Commission discussed the request to install an air conditioning condensor unit at the side of the property.

Ms. Herbert noted that pipe would be located in an inconspicuous location within a drain.

Mr. Marks stated that he had considered plantings to screen the unit but was now thinking of installing a lattice screen.

Mr. Cutting requested that the lattice be in a square design.

Mr. Spang noted that the unit would need at least 2 to 3 feet air space around it.

Mr. Cutting questioned whether open lattice would require less air space around the unit.

Ms. Herbert asked for public comment.

David Hart, a trustee of the Salem Athenaeum, a close abutter of the property, commented that his experience with similar units has shown that emitted sound from the unit would be minimal.

Ms. Bellin noted that the photographic example provided the applicant showed very little space around the unit.

Mr. Marks stated that he would review the product specifications to determine the appropriate air space needed.

Mr. Cutting recommended that the lattice be constructed of wood.

VOTE: *Ms. Bellin made a motion to accept the application with the requirement that lattice screen be constructed of wood in a square design. Ms. McCrea seconded the motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried. Mr. Hart abstained.*

350-352 Essex Street

The Applicant, Blue Sky Properties, submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for new paint colors for the main house and carriage house.

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: June 20, 2016
- Photographs

The owner's manager Bill Murley was present.

Ms. Herbert stated that she visited the property to see the sample paint swatch on the rear carriage house.

Mr. Murley stated that owner is looking to highlight details with accent paint. The main house has a lot of detail that is not visible as currently painted.

Ms. Herbert asked if the storm windows would be removed.

Mr. Murley replied in the negative.

Mr. Hart asked for a paint chip of the proposed Marblehead Gold to make sure that the clapboard would be painted in gold and not white since the paint sample showed both colors.

Mr. Murley replied that he did not have a paint chip but the color was visible on the sample swatch painted on the carriage house as seen in the presented photograph.

Mr. Hart asked for clarification on the painting details for the main house.

Mr. Murley stated that the carriage house would be painted first and the owner was not yet sure of the painting details for the main house.

Ms. Herbert noted that the doors would be changed from red to black.

Mr. Murley noted that gray would be used for the trim accent color.

Mr. Hart asked about the existing white column on the front of the house.

Mr. Murley replied that the column was white when the owner purchased the building.

The Commission asked for specific details on how colors will be used on main house.

Mr. murley stated that details will be highlighted but was not sure how.

Ms. Bellin questioned whether the Commission could approve painting for the carriage house based on the paint swatch sample and wait to approve painting for the main house once details were finalized.

Mr. Spang asked if the owner could provide a similar test patch on the main house for the Commission to review and approve.

Ms. Bellin asked whether windows on the main house would be highlighted with gray like shown on the carriage house.

Mr. Murley replied in the affirmative.

Mr. Hart suggested that the owner contact Sally Zimmerman at Historic New England for suggestions on appropriate way to highlight Italianate house.

Ms. Kelleher stated that she would provide the applicant with her contact information.

Mr. Hart expressed concern about the proposed gray accent color.

Ms. McCrea agreed.

Ms. Bellin asked for specifics on how paint colors would be applied along the roofline.

Mr. Murley replied that the roof details would be painted in the cream color.

Ms. Herbert asked about the doors.

Mr. Murley replied that all doors will be black.

Mr. Spang asked about the diagonal railing on entry to the carriage house.

Mr. Murley stated that the owner would be removing the railing.

Mr. Spang noted that it would be removing a violation.

Ms. Bellin stated that applicant should come back for removal of lattice railing when come back for main house.

Ms. McCrea expressed concern about the use of the gray for the accent, which appeared to be too much of a contrast.

Ms. Herbert expressed concern about the specific cream proposed, which is less earthy than the gold body color. She felt that the cream color had a lemony tint and fights with mustard color of clapboards.

Ms. Bellin expressed concern about the lack of paint chips for review and agreed with Ms. Herbert's concern regarding the trim color.

Ms. Herbert recommended that Commission approve the body color if in agreement.

Mr. Hurley expressed concern that commission is too critical of the personal color choice made by the owner.

Mr. Spang asked if the applicant would consider an alternative color scheme that was approved for 170 Federal Street: Stuart Gold with Sail Cloth.

Ms. Bellin suggested that the Commission approve the proposed body color with alternate options of using Stuart Gold with Sail Cloth.

Mr. Murley stated that owner had worked closely with the paint color consultants at Waters and Brown to come up with the proposed paint color scheme and didn't think that the owner would want to change what was proposed.

The Commission discussed whether the application should be continued to the next meeting to allow the owner to provide more specific details and chips for the paint colors.

VOTE: Ms. Bellin made a motion to continue. Ms. McCrea seconded the motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried.

181 Federal Street

The Applicants, Martha and Jeff Delaney, submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace existing wood gutter on façade of house with a new aluminum gutter.

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: June 20, 2016
- Photographs

The owner Martha Delaney was present and provided a sample of an Essex gutter with an ogee profile.

Ms. Herbert noted that the type of wood now used for gutters does not wear as well as the old growth hard wood used for original gutters. She also expressed the concern about how gutters would be joined to house.

Mr. Spang asked if the gutter would be continuous and how the corners of the gutter would be joined.

Ms. Delaney replied that the gutter would be continuous but she was not sure how corners would be addressed.

Mr. Hart stated that he did not have a problem with replacement of wood gutter with an aluminum gutter since wood does not wear well. He asked about the shape of the downspout.

Ms. Delaney replied that she was not sure about the shape of the downspout.

Ms. Herbert noted that in past the Commission had required rectangular gutter.

Ms. Bellin asked about current downspouts, which are rectangular so would be replacement in-kind. Asked whether the application should be approved under a Certificate of Hardship.

VOTE: *Mr. Hart made a motion to approve the application under a Certificate of Hardship with the requirement that the gutter be white in color with rectangular downspout. Ms. Bellin seconded the motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried.*

Mr. Spang asked Ms. Kelleher to contact fiberglassgutters.com

Ms. Kelleher stated that she would also contact the Arlington Historic Districts Commissions about their experience with fiberglass gutters.

Salem Railroad Signal Tower

Ms. Herbert discussed the letter from the MBTA and Epsilon Associates regarding replacement of the signal tower roof.

Ms. McCrea asked if the building will be reused.

Mr. Spang noted that the drawings provided showed other work proposed for building but not sure if a use has been identified.

Mr. Spang asked about the materials of the existing roofing.

Ms. Herbert stated that the shingles were asbestos.

Mr. Spang expressed concern that most prominent element of building is the roof and the proposed use of asphalt to mimic roof tiles may not be appropriate.

Ms. Herbert noted that replacement is not as nice as original.

Mr. Spang stated that it looks as if the asphalt shingles would be rolled to mimic the original rolled edge.

VOTE: *Mr. Spang made a motion to advise the MBTA that the proposed substitution of asphalt shingles and trim pieces are not sufficiently similar to the original roofing. The roof is an important characteristic feature of tower and is a prominent part of passengers' experience and the MBTA should replace roof with in-kind materials. Ms. Bellin seconded the motion. All were in favor, and the motion so carried. Mr. Hart abstained.*

The Commission agreed that the letter should be addressed to Epsilon Associates and cc'd to the MBTA and Historic Salem, Inc.

Additional Correspondence

PEM Expansion

Ms. Kelleher read an email from Robert Monk from the Peabody Essex Museum about presenting drawings to the Commission on the museum's expansion in August.

Ms. Herbert reported that she spoke with Mr. Monk about the expansion project prior to the DRB meeting in June. She noted that PEM has installed a fence along Charter Street.

Mr. Spang wondered if the fence was in response to complaints from adjacent condominium building.

Federal Court and Charter Street properties

Ms. Kelleher reported that the two vacant buildings on Federal Court and Charter Street, which are owned by the same family, will be restored.

VOTE: *Mr. Cutting made a motion to adjourn. Mr. Spang seconded the motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried.*

Respectfully submitted,

Patti Kelleher
Community Development Planner