

SALEM HISTORICAL COMMISSION
MINUTES
October 7, 2020

A meeting of the Salem Historical Commission was held virtually on Wednesday, October 7, 2020 at 6:00 pm via Zoom meeting platform. Present were: Rebecca English, Milo Martinez, Vijay Joyce, Mark Pattison, Mark Meche, Laurence Spang (Chair), Reed Cutting. Not present: Stacey Norkun, Erin Schaeffer, Mark Pattison

2 North Pine Street - continuation

Theodore Cowan submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to install new fence with gate

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 10/7/20

Ms. Kelleher reported that the applicant requested to withdraw without prejudice.

VOTE: Mr. Cutting made a motion to accept. Mr. Joyce seconded this motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried.

3 Carpenter Street

Jennifer and Jon Firth submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace windows

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 10/7/20

Ms. Kelleher reported that the applicants have requested to continue to the next meeting.

VOTE: Mr. Cutting made a motion to continue the proposal to the next meeting on October 21, 2020. Ms. English seconded this motion. All were in favor and so the motion carried.

21 Winter Street

Sean Maher submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for paint colors and chimney alterations

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 10/7/20

Ms. Kelleher reported that the applicant has requested to continue to the next meeting.

VOTE: Mr. Cutting made a motion to continue the proposal to the meeting on October 21, 2020. Ms. English seconded this motion. All were in favor and so the motion carried.

10 Hawthorne Street - continuation

Andrew Terrat submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for building renovations and paint colors

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 10/7/20
- Photographs
- Elevation Plans

Andrew Terrat was present to discuss the project.

Mr. Terrat presented his request for the following paint colors: the existing body color “Blue Gaspe” would remain with new colors for the trim and for an accent color on the bay panels. “Herbal Escape” would be used for the trim color and black for the windows and doors. “Wedgewood Gray” would be used for the porch ceiling.

For the garage doors, Mr. Terrat presented several options, noting that Option A was his preference. He also noted that the vent in the bathroom would be lowered.

Mr. Terrat presented the option to replace roof shingles with Owens Corning architectural shingles or 3Tab shingles. There is currently unpainted wood shingles on the bay window roof. The home’s gutters would be 1/2 round aluminum and painted with round downspouts. The property’s fence would be painted in ‘Deep River’. The awning window on the south side of the building would be two 16 x 30” windows with vertical panes to match existing muntin configuration on the second floor windows.

Public Comment:

Helen Sides, Broad Street, called attention to the fact that the stained windows were not original. She expressed support for the fence being painted in “Essex Green” to match the neighboring fence color.

Mr. Pattison expressed his preference for keeping the vertical panes on the awning window on the south side to mimic the verticality of the building’s other 2/2 windows. The 24” x 28” awning window would then have just vertical muntins and not horizontal.

VOTE: Mr. Joyce made a motion accept the application as submitted, with the following change to item #6 awning window: applicant has option to install 30” x 24” awning window with vertical muntins. Mr. Cutting seconded the motion. All were in favor and so the motion carried. (Mr. Spang abstained)

16 Kosciusko Street

Samuel Clarke and Anne-Terese Vender submitted an application for a Certificate of Hardship to replace slate roof

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 10/7/20
- Photographs

Sam Clarke and Anne-Terese Vender were present to discuss the project.

The applicants proposed to replace the existing slate roof, which is in deteriorated condition, with GAF Stateline architectural shingles in “Antique Slate”. The existing snow guard would be retained.

Mr. Joyce inquired about the choice of color. Mr. Clarke responded that they selected “Antique Slate” to match the color of the existing slate shingles.

There was no public comment.

VOTE: Mr. Joyce made a motion accept the application as submitted. Mr. Pattison seconded the motion. All were in favor and so the motion carried.

Mr. Cutting left the meeting at this point.

165 Federal Street

Linda Goldstein submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for HVAC minisplit system

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 10/7/20
- Photographs

Linda Goldstein was present to discuss the project.

Ms. Goldstein presented her request to install a new minisplit system at her property. The condenser unit would be located under the rear porch. Mr. Spang suggested checking with the building inspector to make sure that there was no issue locating under egress stair.

Ms. Goldstein noted that an electrical panel under the wall might have to be relocated into the wall. She also noted that the ductwork couldn't be relocated too close to the downspout. She also stated that she explored locating system to the right of the window but the wall was too small for this change.

Mr. Spang recommended asking the installer about doing interior for both walls. Mr. Joyce raised the topic of screening and Ms. Goldstein informed the Commission that it would be done in a lattice method. Mr. Joyce suggested square pattern in wood and painted to match trim color.

Public comment:

Dan Ricciarelli, Essex Street, asked about the pipe size and the applicant confirmed that it was 3". Mr. Ricciarelli also suggested the possibility of installing false plasters to cover the duct pipe.

VOTE: Mr. Joyce made a motion to approve the application with the condition that the conduit be located as to tight to downspout as possible and horizontal above window with the preference for locating the ductwork in the wall. The condenser to be screened with square lattice in wood painted to match trim color. Ms. English seconded this motion. All were in favor and so the motion carried.

18 Chestnut Street

Victoria Kelleher submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for paint colors

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 10/7/20
- Paint color samples

Victoria Kelleher was present to discuss the project.

Ms. Kelleher presented her request for a new paint color for the body of the house - Benjamin Moore "Newburg Green".

Mr. Joyce explained that a darker color would be more appropriate. Ms. English inquired about the shutters and Ms. Kelleher explained that they would be painted in a greenish black "Leapfrog". Mr. Martinez asked about the paint color of the door. The applicant confirmed that it would be painted in the originally approved color.

Mr. Spang suggested that the Commission consider appropriateness versus personal preference. Mr. Joyce recommended that with dark green shutters, a medium color would have more of a contrast. Ms. English agreed and voiced support for a dark color choice but had concerns that the current pick would not effectively contrast with the shutters. Mr. Martinez asked about a possible different color for the shutters. Mr. Spang mentioned choosing a shade of black. Ms. Kelleher was in support of this and would be interested in changing the door to black as well. Mr. Martinez suggested changing the door to match the current sash color.

VOTE: Mr. Martinez made a motion to approve “Newburg Green” (body), Black (shutters), and black or red for the door. Ms. English seconded this motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried. (Mr. Meche abstained)

VOTE: Mr. Martinez made a second motion to allow the option to use the original colors. Mr. Joyce seconded this motion. All were in favor and so the motion carried. (Mr. Meche abstained)

13 Warren Street

Amy and Matt Chambers submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for paint colors

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 10/7/20
- Paint color samples

Amy and Matt Chambers were present.

Mr. Chambers presented the proposed new paint colors: “Coventry Gray” for the body; “Simply White” for the trim; and “Yellow Raincoat” for the door.

VOTE: Ms. English made a motion to accept the application as submitted, with the door in a gloss finish, the trim in a semi-gloss finish and the body in a satin finish. Mr. Joyce seconded this motion. All were in favor and so the motion carried. (Mr. Meche abstained).

90 Federal Street

Carrie Francis Cabot submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for new handrail

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 10/7/20
- Photo of proposed handrail design

Helen Sides, architect was present to discuss the project.

Ms. Sides presented the application to install a new handrail on the left side of the front stairs that would end at the bottom step and connect to the side of the door at the top.

Mr. Spang asked the applicant if the handrail would be in black. Mr. Pattison described how he would prefer to have the handrail attach to the wall, to prevent a hole at the top of the granite. Mr. Martinez asked if there would be a possible issue with the granite splitting.

VOTE: Mr. Pattison made a motion to accept the application as submitted. Mr. Joyce seconded this motion. All were in favor and so the motion carried. (Mr. Meche abstained).

35 Flint Street

Bowditch Condominiums submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for new handrail

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 10/7/20
- Photos of the old pipe rail’s location and the existing side rails with ball top

Inga Milner was present to discuss the project.

The applicant presented photos showing the location of the old pipe rail, installed thirty years ago, as well as visuals of the existing side rails with ball top, added to protect from spikes, which will be painted. She noted that the new railing would be a similar design even though the drawing shows it more like a simple pipe rail.

Mr. Spang asked if it would be painted black to match the existing Galvanized steel. Ms. Milna responded that they will match the existing. Mr. Spang mentioned that iron wrought was another possible option.

VOTE: Mr. Joyce made a motion to accept the application as presented with the railing to match detail of existing galvanized steel and painted to match. Ms. English seconded this motion. All were favor and so the motion carried. (Mr. Meche abstained).

113 Federal Street

Richard W. Lindeman submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace fence

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 10/7/20
- Photographs
- Sketch of fence design

Richard Lindeman was present to discuss the project.

Mr. Lindeman presented the proposal to replace the existing fence with a new Boston fence with a slightly different design than the existing fence. The new fence would be similar to a fence that can be found at 10 Monroe. The existing fence posts and finials will be restored and the gate will be the same size with square pickets. He noted that the fence is position back from the street. The fence would match the current spacing of 3 1/2" but the rails would be located on the sides of the pickets. The current fence's rail is pierced with pickets.

Mr. Pattison questioned if the boards at the side of the posts will remain and the applicant confirmed this. Mr. Pattison then asked if the rails are one piece across with no intermediate post, but Mr. Lindeman did not believe this to be the case. Mr. Pattison made the suggestion to use a 1/4 or 1/2" galvanized pipe to support the bottom rail. Fences with square pickets are usually spaced not so far apart, usually closer together, more like the Monroe fence with a 2 1/2" space.

Mr. Lindeman expressed preference for it to be more open, as this would match spacing on the remaining sidewalk fence. In contrast, Mr. Joyce suggested further spacing to better reflect the Federal Style. Mr. Spang offering the option of using round pickets but Mr. Pattison believed that that round pickets would not be as structurally sound. Mr. Martinez asked the applicant if the rail would be wider to view and for further clarification on how the arc of the gate would be designed.

Mr. Pattison expressed concern about the bulk of the rail against the open spacing. Mr. Joyce inquired if Boston Fence would be able to relocate the rail dimensions. He asked the applicant to present a drawing of the design and a visual indicator of how the arc will be made. The applicant informed the commission that the dimensions of Monroe is 4" and Mine is 2". He will ask Boston Fence if they would be able to match the rail dimensions. Mr. Pattison mentioned that Mahogany may have to be used to provide sufficient stability, for the top rail only since the bottom rail is bulkier.

VOTE: Mr. Joyce made a motion to continue the proposal to the meeting on 10/21. Mr. Martinez seconded this motion. All were in favor and so the motion carried. (Mr. Meche abstained).

43 Chestnut Street

Cynthia J. Williams submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for HVAC minisplit system

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 10/7/20

Helen Sides was present to discuss the project.

Ms. Sides presented the request to install a new HVAC system. She noted that while some units can go near the floor, this system cannot due to interior finishes.

Mr. Spang made a note that the interior is intact and should be preserved.

Mr. Joyce suggested painting the exterior ductwork to match the brick. Ms. Sides agreed and mentioned the preference of darker color tones.

VOTE: Mr. Pattison made a motion to accept the application as presented. Mr. Joyce seconded this motion. Five out of the five members present were favor and so the motion carried. (Mr. Meche abstained)

2 Andover Street

Donald and Regina Gilligan and Timothy and Alison Bildten submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for renovations to rear addition

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 10/7/20
- Drawings by Seger Architects

Dan Ricciarelli and the owners of the property were present to discuss the project.

Mr. Ricciarelli presented the proposal for modifications to the rear ell. The windows on the second floor will be reused and relocated. A new window will be installed on the building's first floor. All new elements will match the existing. The gutters near the street will be in wood, while the others will be aluminum.

Mr. Martinez asked about the pitch of the roof and the applicant described how it will be matching slope. Mr. Martinez had concern that the roof will read as visually flat. Mr. Bildten informed the commission that it will be visible, especially from River St. Mr. Spang asked the applicant to confirm that the goal is to match the pitch of house hopped roof. Mr. Ricciarelli agreed.

Mr. Spang expressed an issue with the design choice of a recessed door. Mr. Ricciarelli drew attention to the driveway and the shared pathway on the property. Mr. Martinez asked how the new hopped roof will intersect with the shed roof to the right. Mr. Ricciarelli described how it will be rebuilt and flashed appropriately.

Public Comments:

John Carr (7 River St.) recommend that the house retains its porch as existing. Mr. Bildten responded that the side porch will be preserved and only the building's rear porch will be enclosed. Mr. Carr was in favor of this decision.

Danielle Hanrahan (Beckford St.) asked if the property's Locust tree would be saved and Mr. Bildten confirmed this.

Marylee Storrs (26 Beckford St.) stated her opinion that the addition is more handsome and her preference that the roof not be raised too much higher since it will block the existing sun from her house. Mr. Bildten took this into consideration.

Mr. Ricciarelli mentioned that they cannot build higher than the third floor window sills.

Mr. Joyce voiced his support for the proposal.

Mr. Spang asked if the aluminum gutter will be in ogee shape. Mr. Ricciarelli confirmed this material choice and described how it would have more volume than a wood option. Mr. Spang informed the applicant that half-round would have sufficient volume. Mr. Ricciarelli agreed with this statement but noted that the half-round would not match with rest of house.

VOTE: Mr. Joyce made a motion to accept the application as submitted, with final plans to be given to Ms. Kelleher. Ms. English seconded this motion. All were favor and so the motion carried. (Mr. Meche abstained).

343 Essex Street

Alexandra and Ryan Strack submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace windows

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 10/7/20

Alexandra Stack, Ryan Stack and Ryan Clancy, Pella Window representative, were present to discuss the project.

Mr. Strack noted that the house inspector indicated issues with the windows.

Mr. Clancy noted that the new windows will be Pella Architect series with a wood painted exterior and no Low E glass.

Mr. Joyce asked if a 2" sill was considered as the drawings show 1 1/8". Mr. Clancy answered that the sill can be made 2" to match the existing.

Mr. Spang asked if the extension of the sill "ears" can be replicated and the applicant confirmed this. The Commission questioned if the rear windows had wider sills.

Mr. Spang asked the applicants if they considered restoration. Ms. Stack described the previous owner's maintenance schedule and noted that most of the windows are inoperable.

Mr. Spang expressed concern about not seeing the condition of the windows before approving the removal.

Mr. Martinez asked if replacing sash only was a possible option. Mr. Clancy explained that it would be difficult to place a new sash in the old opening.

Mr. Joyce asked if the glass would be the same. Mr. Clancy described the 1/8" difference.

Mr. Pattison expressed concern with the replacement of the original windows and Ms. English suggested a site visit to determine if they are original.

VOTE: Mr. Martinez made a motion to continue the proposal to the meeting on 10/21. Mr. Pattison seconded this motion. Five out of the five members present were in favor and so the motion carried. (Mr. Meche abstained).

The Commission and the applicants agreed to a site visit for October 15, 2021 at 8am.

49 Washington Square

Forty Two North Properties LLC submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace windows

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 10/7/20

Jim Flynn was present to discuss the project.

Mr. Flynn presented his proposal to replace existing windows with Marvin Ultimate wood windows but noted that he was okay with changing to Pella Architect Series since this window was used on the other half of the building. He noted that the rear windows are not visible from a street named in the district.

Mr. Flynn mentioned that some of the current windows are replacements from the 1980s and hopes to replace all.

Public Comment:

Barb Swartz, 47 Washington Square, informed the Commission that the windows in her half of the building were replaced ten years ago with Pella Architect series windows.

VOTE: Ms. English made a motion to continue the proposal to the meeting on 10/21 after a site visit. Mr. Joyce seconded this motion. All were in favor and so the motion carried. (Mr. Meche abstained).

A site visit was planned for October 15, 2021 at 9am.

FY21 Community Preservation Plan – Request for Comment/Input – continuation

The Commission reviewed the comment letter submitted in FY20 and discussed recommendations for the FY21 CPA plan. Ms. Kelleher suggested a recommendation for allocating funds for burial marker restoration at the City's historic cemeteries to continue efforts to preserve these historic resources. The Commission agreed and also agreed to reissue recommendations set forth in the FY20 plan as they are still relevant. Ms. Kelleher agreed to circulate a draft letter for the Commission's review and approval.

Other Business

7 Carpenter Street

Ms. Kelleher and Mr. Pattison reported that an extra downspout was added to the property without the applicant coming back to the Commission, which was a requirement of the approved certificate. The Commission agreed to request applicant to appear before the Commission at the next meeting.

149 Federal Street

Ms. Kelleher reported on the constructed rear entry porch that does not comply with the issued certificate. The Commission agreed that the owner should submit a letter to request a Certificate of Hardship with reasons for request.

VOTE: Mr. Joyce made a motion to adjourn the meeting. Mr. Pattison seconded this motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried.

The meeting adjourned at 10pm

Respectfully submitted,
Patti Kelleher, Preservation Planner